

Minutes

Culture and Communities Committee

10.00am, Thursday 10 August 2023

Present:

Councillors Walker (Convener), Lezley Marion Cameron, Glasgow, Heap, McFarlane, McNeese-Mechan, Mitchell, Munro, Nicolson (substituting for Councillor Glasgow – item 18), Osler, Staniforth and Thornley.

1. Deputations

**a) Jack Kane Community Centre
(in relation to item 7.5 on the agenda Response to Motion by Councillor Campbell – Lifelong Learning Review)**

The deputation indicated that it embraced change and understood the need for change within communities. Whilst there were many elements of the review which should be embraced, they felt that they needed to go back to the drawing board regarding the Council's support and development of work within community centres.

The deputation stressed that at this time they still felt that they were no further forward and the loss was currently being felt within the community and across Edinburgh. They felt that at this time community centres were hardly being viewed by the Council as vital assets for progressive partnerships to flourish for the benefit of the people and the city.

The deputation urged the Council to think creatively, to look for new possibilities which reflected the changing face of some of the community centres in Edinburgh rather than seeking to reduce people and services to certain community centres which was already having a real impact on the ground.

(see item 10 below)

**b) Friends of the Meadows and Bruntsfield Links
(in relation to item 7.6 on the agenda - Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation Project)**

The deputation indicated there had been no input from the community or local groups regarding the proposal for a bronze replica Jawbone at the foot of the Meadows but appreciated why the Council had brought forward such a proposal although they felt that a bronze replica may not be in keeping with the surrounding area.

The deputation urged the Committee to engage with the local community regarding the proposals and to explore alternative options.

(see item 11 below)

**c) Friends of the Montgomery Street Park and Chair of the Play Park Subgroup
(in relation to item 9.7 on the agenda - Motion by Councillor Caldwell – Montgomery Street Park Helter Skelter)**

The deputation indicated a community consultation had concluded overwhelmingly that the community wanted to retain the helter skelter in Montgomery Street Park and found that residents considered it an iconic structure in the neighbourhood. They felt that it was something instantly recognisable and representative of the locality, beloved by children, parents and carers alike, a magnet for families - not just local but many who travelled across the city to visit the park because of the helter skelter.

The deputation stressed that the helter skelter was the centre of so much joy and excitement but importantly also something that required children to learn to assess danger and risk. They agreed that the helter skelter needed to be in good working condition and had committed to working with the Parks team - raising funds if necessary - to achieve that.

(see item 23 below)

2. Minutes

Decision

- 1) To approve the minute of the Culture and Communities Committee of 11 May 2023 as a correct record.
- 2) To approve the minute of the Culture and Communities Committee of 8 June 2023 as a correct record.

3. Work Programme

The Committee's Work Programme was presented for review.

Decision:

To note the work programme.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Work Programme 10 August 2023, submitted)

4. Rolling Actions Log

The Culture and Communities Committee Rolling Actions Log was presented.

Decision:

- 1) To agree to close the following actions:
 - **Action 9(3)** - Business Bulletin Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation Project
 - **Action 13** - UCI Cycling World Championships 2023
 - **Action 15** - Emergency Motion – Edinburgh Filmhouse and Edinburgh International Film Festival
 - Action 16 - Edinburgh's Christmas – Motion by Councillor McVey
 - **Action 17(3)** - Edinburgh Leisure Pitch Hire Prices – Motion by Councillor Campbell
 - **Action 19** - Business Bulletin Edinburgh Filmhouse
 - **Action 26** - Library Collection Development (Reflecting Edinburgh's National, Ethnic and Linguistic Diversity) – Motion by Councillor Heap
 - **Action 28** - Filmhouse – Emergency Motion by Councillor Walker
 - **Action 31** - Motion by Councillor Heap – Concessionary Ticket Schemes for Cultural Events
 - **Action 33** - Motion by Councillor O'Neill – Edinburgh's Monuments and Commemoration
 - **Action 34** - Motion by Councillor McFarlane – Save the Filmhouse
 - **Action 39(1)** - Response to Motion by Councillor Osler – Tree Protection in East and West Princes Street Gardens
 - **Action 40** - Guidance on Park Lighting
 - **Action 48** - Response to Motion by Councillor McVey – Edinburgh's Christmas
- 2) To note the rolling actions log would be updated to reflect decisions taken at this meeting and otherwise note the remaining outstanding actions.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Rolling Actions Log 10 August 2023, submitted)

5. Business Bulletin

The Culture and Communities business bulletin was presented.

Decision

To note the updates in the business bulletin.

(Reference – Culture and Communities Committee Business Bulletin 10 August 2023, submitted)

6. Police Scotland – Edinburgh City Division Scrutiny Report – April 2022 to Match 2023

An update was provided on Police Scotland’s Edinburgh City Division city-wide plans, policies and performance for April to December 2022.

Superintendents Mark Rennie and Sam Ainslie spoke to the report and responded to members’ questions.

Decision

To note the report.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Corporate Service, submitted)

7. Scottish Fire and Rescue Service – Local Plan Performance Report – City of Edinburgh – April 2022 to March 2023

An update was provided on the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service prevention, protection and operational response activities within the City of Edinburgh area during the period April 2022 to March 2023.

David Dourley and Rick Stark, Scottish Fire and Rescue Service spoke to the report, and responded to members’ questions.

Decision

To note the update.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services, submitted)

8. Response to Motion by Councillor Heap – Concessionary Tickets Schemes for Cultural Events

Thursday, 10th August, 2023

In response to the motion by Councillor Heap, details were provided on the extensive current event and venue-related concessionary and free ticketing provision which facilitated access to cultural opportunities and experiences in the city and highlighted that there was potential to further explore ticketing model options to potentially provide local benefit for Council hosted/owned events.

Motion

- 1) To note that provision of cultural events and activity concessionary ticket schemes was comprehensive citywide and that the models reflected the extensive variety of activity.
 - 2) To note that free access to cultural events and activity was also widely provided, and that models varied reflecting the extensive range of providers and activity.
 - 3) To note that there was no one-size-fits-all model for provision of concessionary ticket schemes and that they were, however, virtually universally provided by venues, producers and organisers.
 - 4) To agree to further exploration of box office-related local benefit options via Council hosted and/or owned events and activities going forward.
- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

Amendment 1

- 1) To note that provision of cultural events and activity concessionary ticket schemes was comprehensive citywide and that the models reflected the extensive variety of activity.
 - 2) To note that free access to cultural events and activity was also widely provided, and that models varied reflecting the extensive range of providers and activity.
 - 3) To note that there was no one-size-fits-all model for provision of concessionary ticket schemes and that they were, however, virtually universally provided by venues, producers and organisers.
 - 4) To agree to further exploration of box office-related local benefit options via Council hosted and/or owned events and activities going forward.
 - 5) To agree to a further update to Committee within one year on any progress made on paragraph 4).
- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

Amendment 2

Committee notes that

Thursday, 10th August, 2023

- 1) The report has found good free and reduced cost access to cultural events in the city.
- 2) But opportunities for free and reduced access to events is not always known about by those who may benefit most.
- 3) Free and reduce cost access to cultural events is important to tackling poverty in the city.

Committee therefore requests that:

- 4) Officers produce and advertise a webpage which signposts to sources of free and reduced cost access to cultural events in the city, or
- 5) Report back to the Committee should this not prove possible.

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22 (12), Amendments 1 and 2 were accepted as addendums to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note that provision of cultural events and activity concessionary ticket schemes was comprehensive citywide and that the models reflected the extensive variety of activity.
- 2) To note that free access to cultural events and activity was also widely provided, and that models varied reflecting the extensive range of providers and activity.
- 3) To note that there was no one-size-fits-all model for provision of concessionary ticket schemes and that they were, however, virtually universally provided by venues, producers and organisers.
- 4) To agree to further exploration of box office-related local benefit options via Council hosted and/or owned events and activities going forward.
- 5) To agree to a further update to Committee within one year on any progress made on paragraph 4).
- 6) To note that the report had found good free and reduced cost access to cultural events in the city.
- 7) To note that opportunities for free and reduced access to events was not always known about by those who might benefit most.
- 8) To note that free and reduced cost access to cultural events was important to tackling poverty in the city.

- 9) To agree that officers produce and advertise a webpage which signposted to sources of free and reduced cost access to cultural events in the city and to agree to report back to the Committee should this not prove possible.

(References – Act of Council No. 26 of 9 February 2023; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted).

9. Response to Motion by Councillor McFarlane – Save the Filmhouse

In response to a motion by Councillor McFarlane, an update was provided on the current position, regarding the Edinburgh Filmhouse building, 88 Lothian Road.

Motion

To note the progress update on the current position with regard to The Filmhouse building on 88 Lothian Road.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

Amendment

- 1) To note the progress update on the current position with regard to The Filmhouse building on 88 Lothian Road.
- 2) Recognises and commends the tremendous achievements and determination thus far of the new charity Filmhouse Edinburgh in reaching this stage in negotiations, restating our support for them in their endeavours.
- 3) Thanks Council Officers for their continued hard work and efforts.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor McNeese-Mechan

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the progress update on the current position with regard to The Filmhouse building on 88 Lothian Road.
- 2) To recognise and commend the tremendous achievements and determination thus far of the new charity Filmhouse Edinburgh in reaching this stage in negotiations, restating support for them in their endeavours.
- 3) To thank Council Officers for their continued hard work and efforts.

(References – Act of Council No 29 of 4 May 2023; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

10. Response to Motion by Councillor Campbell -Lifelong Learning Review

In response to a motion by Councillor Campbell an update was provided on the Lifelong Learning Review

The Committee had considered a written deputation from Jack Kane Community Centre on this issue (see item 1(b) above).

Motion

To note the update on the Lifelong Learning Review, as requested by the Council on 4 May 2023.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

Amendment 1

- 1) To note the update on the Lifelong Learning Review, as requested by the Council on 4 May 2023.
- 2) Notes the report states at 5.1: "detailed transition plans have been developed and are being implemented to ensure effective handover of responsibilities". Therefore, agrees that the transition plans should be shared with the committee, local elected members and management committees detailing how continuity can be maintained for existing services and groups ensuring that there are no gaps in service.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor McNeese-Mechan

Amendment 2

- 1) To note the update on the Lifelong Learning Review, as requested by the Council on 4 May 2023.
- 2) Requests a further update, by way of a briefing note circulated to all councillors, detailing to which executive committees each of the new service areas (listed at 4.3) reports, and a named lead officer for each.

- moved by Councillor Thornley, seconded by Councillor Osler

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendment 1 was adjusted and accepted as an addendum to the Motion and Amendment 2 was accepted as an addendum to the Motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the update on the Lifelong Learning Review, as requested by the Council on 4 May 2023.
- 2) To note that the report stated at 5.1: "detailed transition plans have been developed and are being implemented to ensure effective handover of responsibilities". Therefore, to agree that the transition plans should be shared with the committee, all elected members and management committees detailing how continuity could be maintained for existing services and groups ensuring that there were no gaps in service.
- 3) To request a further update, by way of a briefing note circulated to all councillors, detailing to which executive committees each of the new service areas (listed at 4.3) reported, and a named lead officer for each.

(References – Act of Council No 34 of 4 May 2023; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

11. Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation Project

Approval was sought on the proposal as part of The Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation project to dispose of the original Jawbones as they were considered beyond reasonable repair, unable to be relocated safely and now a cost pressure to the Council.

The Committee had heard a deputation from Friends of the Meadows and Bruntsfield Links on this issue (see item 1(b) above).

Motion

- 1) To note the update on the Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation Project, and the information provided in respect of ideas for creative conservation of the Jawbones.
- 2) To agree to dispose of the existing Jawbones which are deemed unviable for suitable public display.
- 3) To agree to continue the exploration of creative conservation solutions until October 2023, with the outcome of this reported to Group Spokespeople.
- 4) To note that, if a creative solution is not found, the original Jawbones will be disposed in line with guidance from City Archaeologist with cross-section pieces kept and accessioned into the museum collections with a view to being installed at a suitable location within the Museums and Galleries service.
- 5) To agree to advance discussions with stakeholders and potential funders on the commission of a bronze replacement.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

Amendment 1

- 1) To note the update on the Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation Project, and the information provided in respect of ideas for creative conservation of the Jawbones.
- 2) To agree to dispose of the existing Jawbones which are deemed unviable for suitable public display.
- 3) To agree to continue the exploration of creative conservation solutions until October 2023, with the outcome of this reported to Group Spokespeople.
- 4) Agrees to contact The Collective, Edinburgh's Centre for Contemporary Art who may be well placed to organise a commission using the Jawbone as a medium, and notes that this could perhaps provide a rare opportunity for an artist to respond to Edinburgh's whaling heritage and modern concerns of conservation of endangered species in a new public artwork
- 5) To note that, if a creative solution is not found, the original Jawbones will be disposed in line with guidance from City Archaeologist with cross-section pieces kept and accessioned into the museum collections with a view to being installed at a suitable location within the Museums and Galleries service.
- 6) To agree to advance discussions with stakeholders and potential funders on the commission of a bronze replacement.

- moved by McFarlane, seconded by Councillor McNeese-Mechan

Amendment 2

- 1) To agree that the Jawbone Arch is a longstanding, much-loved landmark in Edinburgh
- 2) To agree that should preservation, in-situ, not be possible, then the optimal outcomes are:
 - a) As full as preservation of the Arch as possible, on view to the public in a different place, and
 - b) A replica to be made and located in place of the Arch.
- 3) To note the update on the Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation Project, and the information provided in respect of ideas for creative conservation of the Jawbones.
- 4) To agree to continue the exploration of creative conservation solutions.

Thursday, 10th August, 2023

- 5) To agree to advance discussions with stakeholders and potential funders on the commission of a bronze replacement.
- 6) Requests a report to Culture and Communities Committee recommending a way forward at the conclusion of the processes outlined in 3) and 4).

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), the motion was adjusted, and Amendment 1 accepted an addendum to the Motion.

Voting

| | | |
|------------------------------|---|---------|
| For the Motion (as adjusted) | - | 9 votes |
| For Amendment 2 | - | 2 votes |

(For the Motion (as adjusted): Councillors Lezley Marion Cameron, Glasgow, McFarlane, McNeese-Mechan, Mitchell, Munro, Osler, Thornley and Walker.

For Amendment 2: Councillors Heap and Staniforth.)

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the update on the Meadows Jawbone Arch Conservation Project, and the information provided in respect of ideas for creative conservation of the Jawbones.
- 2) To agree to dispose of the existing Jawbones which are deemed unviable for suitable public display.
- 3) To agree to continue the exploration of creative conservation solutions until October 2023, with the outcome of this reported to Group Spokespeople.
- 4) To agree to contact The Collective, Edinburgh's Centre for Contemporary Art who might be well placed to organise a commission using the Jawbone as a medium, and note that this could perhaps provide a rare opportunity for an artist to respond to Edinburgh's whaling heritage and modern concerns of conservation of endangered species in a new public artwork.
- 5) To note that, if a creative solution is not found, the original Jawbones would be disposed in line with guidance from City Archaeologist with cross-section pieces kept and accessioned into the museum collections with a view to being installed at a suitable location within the Museums and Galleries service.
- 6) To agree to advance discussions with stakeholders and potential funders on the commission of a replacement.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

12. Delivering the 20-Minute Neighbourhood Strategy - Update

An update was provided on the Council's 20-Minute Neighbourhood Strategy and key projects that were being progressed and approval sought of a revised Strategy.

Decision

- 1) To note the update on the 20-Minute Neighbourhood Strategy and key projects that were being progressed.
- 2) To agree the updated 20-Minute Neighbourhood Strategy.
- 3) To agree to 6 monthly Business Bulletin updates being presented to the Committee.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

13. Response to Motion by Councillor O'Neill - Edinburgh's Monuments and Commemoration

In response to a motion by Councillor O'Neill details were provided on the current process for how new statues, monuments and commemorative structures were decided upon in the city, and what role the Council played in this, together with options for establishing a new policy and process for new statue /monument / commemorative structure proposals, to ensure that these contributed to the objectives set out in 3.1.5 of the report by the Executive Director of Place, including further options for improving representation amongst commemorative structures erected in the city.

Motion

- 1) To note the options presented to develop a Public Art Strategy (to encompass public art, monuments and commemorations) for the city.
- 2) To agree to proceed with the development of this strategy in-house.
- 3) To note that, if 2) above was agreed, it was expected that the policy would be presented to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in August 2024 for approval, before being referred to the Culture and Communities Committee for information.
- 4) To note that an audit of existing public art, monuments and commemorations would be produced as part of the development of the strategy.
- 5) To refer the report by the Executive Director of Place to the Planning Committee for information.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

Amendment 1

Thursday, 10th August, 2023

- 1) To note the options presented to develop a Public Art Strategy (to encompass public art, monuments and commemorations) for the city and agree that this Strategy should also aim to incorporate a mechanism to support local businesses, community groups and participatory community art projects to navigate the permissions, considerations and process should they express an interest in installing public realm works such as murals.
- 2) To agree to proceed with the development of this strategy in-house.
- 3) To note that, if 2) above was agreed, it was expected that the policy would be presented to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in August 2024 for approval, before being referred to the Culture and Communities Committee for information.
- 4) To note that an audit of existing public art, monuments and commemorations would be produced as part of the development of the strategy.
- 5) To refer the report by the Executive Director of Place to the Planning Committee for information.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor McNeese-Mechan

Amendment 2

- 1) To note the options presented to develop a Public Art Strategy (to encompass public art, monuments and commemorations) for the city.
- 2) To agree to proceed with the development of this strategy in-house in addition to what was set out in 5.1.4 of the report by the Executive Director of Place, regular updates would be provided in the Culture and Communities Business Bulletin
- 3) To note that, if 2) above was agreed, it was expected that the policy would be presented to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in August 2024 for approval, before being referred to the Culture and Communities Committee for information.
- 4) To note that an audit of existing public art, monuments and commemorations would be produced as part of the development of the strategy and would be provided to the Culture and Communities Committee.
- 5) To refer the report by the Executive Director of Place to the Planning Committee for information.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

Amendment 3

- 1) To note the options presented to develop a Public Art Strategy (to encompass public art, monuments and commemorations) for the city.

Thursday, 10th August, 2023

- 2) To agree to continue the decision for one cycle to allow for more detail to be provided on Section 6, including estimated costs, and officer numbers and time required, for a best-value and better-informed decision.
- 3) To note that, if 2) above was agreed, it was expected that the policy would be presented to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in August 2024 for approval, before being referred to the Culture and Communities Committee for information.
- 4) To note that an audit of existing public art, monuments and commemorations would be produced as part of the development of the strategy.
- 5) To refer the report by the Executive Director of Place to the Planning Committee for information.

- moved by Councillor Mitchell, seconded by Councillor Munro

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendments 1 and 2 were accepted as amendments to the Motion.

Voting

The voting was as follows:

| | | |
|------------------------------|---|---------|
| For the Motion (as adjusted) | - | 9 votes |
| For Amendment 3 | - | 2 votes |

For the Motion (as adjusted): Councillors Lesley Marion Cameron, Glasgow, Heap, McFarlane, McNeese-Mechan, Osler, Staniforth, Thornley and Walker

For Amendment 3: Councillors Mitchell and Munro.)

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker

- 1) To note the options presented to develop a Public Art Strategy (to encompass public art, monuments and commemorations) for the city; and agree that this Strategy should also aim to incorporate a mechanism to support local businesses, community groups and participatory community art projects to navigate the permissions, considerations and process should they express an interest in installing public realm works such as murals.
- 2) To agree to proceed with the development of this strategy in-house in addition to what is set out in 5.1.4 of the report by the Executive Director of Place, regular updates would be provided in the Culture and Communities Business Bulletin.

- 3) To note that it was expected that the policy would be presented to the Policy and Sustainability Committee in August 2024 for approval, before being referred to the Culture and Communities Committee for information.
- 4) To note that an audit of existing public art, monuments and commemorations would be produced as part of the development of the strategy and would be provided to the Culture and Communities Committee.
- 5) To refer the report by the Executive Director of Place to the Planning Committee for information.

(References – Act of Council No 30 of 16 March 2023; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

14. Edinburgh's Winter Festivals – Update on Procurement

Approval was sought for the draft specification for procurement of a prime contractor for Edinburgh's Winter Festivals and the contract duration (three years, with the option of two one year extensions at the sole discretion of the Council).

An update on next steps in respect of actions agreed by Committee in June 2023 to explore potential future models of provision and investment in sustainable infrastructure was also provided.

Motion

- 1) To agree the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Place.
 - 2) To agree the core Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) as set out in Appendix 2 to the report.
 - 3) To note that further KPIs would be developed upon submission of final tenders.
 - 4) To agree the recommended contract term of three years plus up to two optional extension years including break clauses.
 - 5) To note the provisions and process for breaks during the contract.
- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

Amendment 1

- 1) Regrets the lack of political support from the Administration parties for the SNP's proposal for a joint venture which would have maximised public control and minimised public cost. Agree to the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in Appendix 1 with the following additions to the specifications:

Thursday, 10th August, 2023

- a) Replaces 2.13. with: “The Contractor must deliver a programme of events (especially for Edinburgh’s Christmas) within the city centre and reaching into fourteen local town centres and communities outwith the city centre, where possible aligned to public transport and active travel routes. Noting the permanent cultural infrastructure that supports Edinburgh’s global reputation year-round, engagement and opportunities for collaboration with Edinburgh’s community theatres and community centres eg: Leith Theatre and Whale Arts should be sought”.
 - b) Adds “2.14.10 Wester Hailes, 2.14.11 Niddrie, 2.14.12 Saughton, 2.14.13 Granton and 2.14.14 Queensferry” to the list of Town Centres for consideration; amending “nine” to “fourteen”.
 - c) Further adds to 3.1.18 Where possible The Contractor must aim to reduce or eliminate single-use plastic usage across their sites.”
- 2) To agree the core Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) as set out in Appendix 2 to the report.
 - 3) To note that further KPIs would be developed upon submission of final tenders.
 - 4) Agree on the recommended contract term of three years plus up to two optional extension years including break clauses; and in doing so, agree that there shall be engagement / a review before and after each year with key stakeholders inclusive of the primary affected residential community councils: Old Town Community Council, West End Community Council, New Town Broughton Community Council, Tollcross Community Council.
 - 5) To note the provisions and process for breaks during the contract.
 - 6) Note that if we are in a situation where break clauses have to be implemented, due to a failure on the act of The Contractor, the tender process will have been shown yet again to be unsatisfactory and not fit for purpose, falling below the expectations of Edinburgh’s residents. Therefore requests that in the meantime, officers explore and develop the SNP’s proposals for a joint venture model, which could enable the Council to work in tandem as an equal partner delivering Edinburgh’s Christmas and Hogmanay in a way that truly reflects the outcome of the consultation ran in the previous administration.

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor Glasgow

Amendment 2

- 1) To agree the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh’s Christmas and Edinburgh’s Hogmanay in Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Place.
- 2) To agree the core Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) as set out in Appendix 2 to the report.

- 3) To note that further KPIs would be developed upon submission of final tenders.
- 4) Requests a report prior to commencement of the Prime Contractor procurement (or within one cycle thereafter), on mechanisms managing persistent and/or serious non-performance against KPIs, to include development of a remedial plan at the time, supported by termination rights if not duly delivered.
- 5) To agree the recommended contract term of three years plus up to two optional extension years including break clauses subject to agreed adjustment of subsidy levels for extension years in light of what is to be delivered, bearing in mind levels of committed investment already made in Years 1 to 3.
- 6) To note the provisions and process for breaks during the contract.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

Amendment 3

A Contract Extension

- 1) Committee notes that:
 - Scrutiny of award of a contract extension would be beneficial
- 2) Committee therefore agrees the recommended contract term of three years plus up to two optional extension years including break clauses approves 1.1.4 of the report with the following amendment:
 - a) Proposals to extend then contract beyond 3 years should be subject to approval by Culture and Communities Committee.

B Climate, Nature and Environment

Committee notes that:

- 3) The Specification asks prospective providers to support the Council in its delivery of the 2020 Sustainability Strategy, which appears to be an outdated strategy over 10 years old.
- 4) With footfall into the millions, the climate, nature and environmental impact of the Winter Festivals is significant.
- 5) That prospective bidders may not have sufficient internal expertise related to dealing with the climate, nature and environment aspects of the delivery of the Winter Festivals
- 6) Committee therefore agrees the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Place with the following amendment:

- a) Officers refresh the reference documentation in the Environment section to ensure it fully incorporates all relevant current Council strategies related to climate, nature and environment.
- b) Officers provide more guidance on how the Winter Festivals can support the Council's aims to tackle climate change in the city and protect nature and the environment in the city.
- c) Officers adjust the Specification to require annual reporting on the climate, nature and environmental impact of the previous year's festivals (the first year excepted) and what the provider is planning to do in the next year (the last year excepted) to tackle climate change and protect nature and the environment.

C Diesel Generators

Committee notes that:

- 7) Diesel generators are widely used at Festivals in the city
- 8) Diesel generators are incompatible with the City's climate ambitions
- 9) That the current specification instructs bidders to "prioritise power sources that do not rely on diesel generators" and specifies an associated KPI, but offers no clear incentives to prioritise alternative power sources.
- 10) Committee therefore agrees the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Place with the following amendments
 - a) In the Draft Specification, Section 2.18, insert new sentence at end: "The Contractor must provide regular updates on how it is seeking to reduce diesel generator use."

D Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)

Committee notes:

- 11) The climate, nature and environmental impact of the Winter Festivals is significant.
- 12) There are KPIs related to recycling, local sourcing of food, diesel generators and tree protection, but a more comprehensive set of environmental KPIs would be important to ensure the Winter Festivals are sustainable and tackle climate change.
- 13) Committee therefore agrees the core Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) as set out in Appendix 2 to the report with the following amendments:

- a) Officers investigate whether it would be possible to set annual increases in the first four KPIs in the Sustainability section, and edit the KPIs accordingly should this be possible
- b) Officers consider adding KPIs on:
 - i) Sustainable water management
 - ii) Use of renewable energy-powered generators
 - iii) Sustainable freight arrangements for goods and equipment delivered to the Festivals' venues
 - iv) Availability of plant-based food

E In-Housing specific elements of the Winter Festivals

Committee notes:

- 14) That Officers do not completely believe complete in-housed delivery is possible at present but notes also the intention in 5.5-5.10 of the report to examine in-housing of the Festivals, subjecting to funding of posts to conduct this work.
- 15) That it may be possible to in-house specific elements of the Festivals for some of the proposed contract period
- 16) Committee therefore agrees the recommended contract term of three years plus up to two optional extension years including break clauses with the following amendment:
 - a) Committee requests that Officers urgently examine what scope there is for in-housing specific elements of the Winter Festivals ahead of extension of the contract, with officers reporting back to the Culture and Communities Committee on this issue well ahead of the time for the contract extension

F Real Living Wage

Committee notes that:

- 17) The Real Living Wage, as defined by the Living Wage Foundation, is based on the cost of living and is an essential tool for social justice and equality
- 18) The City of Edinburgh Council is committed to the Real Living Wage (RLW)
- 19) Notes that although Officers will rule out from further consideration any provider who indicates when asked that they are not willing to pay the Real Living Wage, there is still no clear requirement in the Specification for the successful contractor to pay the RLW.
- 20) Ongoing checks that the RLW is being paid are desirable.

- 21) Committee therefore agrees the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Place with the following amendments:
- a) In the Draft Specification, Section 2.1, delete "demonstrate commitment to ensuring" and insert "Ensure" and "insert after "employed for the Winter Festival", "including by any subcontractors working at the Festival"
 - b) Insert at bottom of second column of first row in table of Specification Appendix 2 "Percentage of staff being paid the Real Living Wage"
 - c) Insert at bottom of third column of first row in table of Specification Appendix 2 "100%"

G Community Benefits

Committee notes:

- 22) That Community Benefits provided under previous iterations of the Winter Festivals have been variable in quality and appropriateness.
- 23) Committee therefore approves the report with the following amendment:
- a) Officers should ensure that the Community Benefits delivered are:
 - i) Appropriate to the length of the contract and size of the Festivals
 - ii) Promote access to the Festivals, especially for groups who might be excluded
 - iii) Supportive of the Council's values

H Free and Discounted Access to Hogmanay Event

Committee notes:

- 24) That discounted tickets to the Hogmanay event have historically been available to people living in EH postcodes, but is not referenced in the Specification
- 25) Notes that only 100 free tickets were available for 2022/3 Hogmanay event, which sold 30,000 tickets
- 26) Committee therefore agrees the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Place with the following amendment:
- a) Officers add a requirement for discounted Hogmanay tickets to the Specification

- b) Officers add a requirement for an appropriate number of free tickets to be provided

- moved by Councillor Heap, seconded by Councillor Staniforth

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendment 2 was adjusted and accepted as an amendment to the Motion.

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), Amendments 2 and 3 were accepted as amendments to Amendment 1.

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the Motion (as adjusted): - 6 votes
For Amendment 1 (as adjusted) - 5 votes

(For the motion (as adjusted): Councillors Lezley Marion Cameron, Mitchell, Munro, Osler, Thornley and Walker.

For Amendment 1 (as adjusted): Councillors Glasgow, Heap, McFarlane, McNeese Mechan and Staniforth.)

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To agree the specification for the delivery of Edinburgh's Christmas and Edinburgh's Hogmanay in Appendix 1 to the report by the Executive Director of Place.
- 2) To agree the core Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) as set out in Appendix 2 to the report.
- 3) To note that further KPIs would be developed upon submission of final tenders.
- 4) To request a report prior to commencement of the Prime Contractor procurement (or within one cycle thereafter), on mechanisms managing persistent and/or serious non-performance against KPIs, to include development of a remedial plan at the time, supported by termination rights if not duly delivered and available resources.
- 5) To agree the recommended contract term of three years plus up to two optional extension years including break clauses subject to agreed adjustment of subsidy levels for extension years in light of what is to be delivered, bearing in mind levels of committed investment already made in Years 1 to 3.
- 6) To note the provisions and process for breaks during the contract.

(References – Culture and Communities Committee of 8 June 2023 (item 1); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

15. Parks and Openspace Investment Update

An update was provided on the Parks and Openspace investment programme for 2023/24.

Motion

To note the update on the Parks and Openspace investment programme and that the next update would be presented to Committee on 29 February 2024, with an update on the additional investment for 2023/24 to be included in the Business Bulletin for Committee on 7 December 2023.

- moved by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Lezley Marion Cameron

Amendment

- 1) To note the update on the Parks and Openspace investment programme and that the next update would be presented to Committee on 29 February 2024, with an update on the additional investment for 2023/24 to be included in the Business Bulletin for Committee on 7 December 2023.
- 2) Requests a briefing note be circulated to committee members detailing the countryside improvement projects referenced at 5.3 and how they fit in with the Thriving Greenspace and Biodiversity strategies.
- 3) Notes the update at 4.4 regarding the Water of Leith pathway and requests a further update in the business bulletin detailing the current accessibility of the Water of Leith pathway, and what necessary work remains outstanding.

- moved by Councillor Thornley, seconded by Councillor Osler

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Walker:

- 1) To note the update on the Parks and Openspace investment programme and that the next update would be presented to Committee on 29 February 2024, with an update on the additional investment for 2023/24 to be included in the Business Bulletin for Committee on 7 December 2023.
- 2) To request a briefing note be circulated to committee members detailing the countryside improvement projects referenced at 5.3 in the report by the Executive Director of Place and how they fitted in with the Thriving Greenspace and Biodiversity strategies.

- 3) To note the update at 4.4 in the report regarding the Water of Leith pathway and request a further update in the business bulletin detailing the current accessibility of the Water of Leith pathway, and what necessary work remained outstanding.

(Reference –report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

Declaration of interests

Councillor McFarlane made a transparency statement in respect of the above item as a Member of Friends of Calton Hill.

Councillor Osler made a transparency statement in respect of the above item as a member of Friends of Inverleith Park.

16. Response to Motion by Councillor Heap – Library Collection Development (Reflecting Edinburgh’s National, Ethnic and Linguistic Diversity)

In response to a motion by Councillor Heap on the steps that the library service had taken to ensure the expended provision of library resources for refugees from Ukraine, and how the library collections had been developed to meet readers needs arising from the city’s growing national ethnic and linguistic diversity.

Decision

To note the update on the Council’s library collection development, which had been prepared in response to a motion by Councillor Heap on 13 December 2022.

(References – Culture and Communities Committee of 13 December 2022 (item 16); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

17. By Councillor McFarlane - Closure of The Nelson Monument

The following motion by Councillor McFarlane was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee:

- 1) Notes that the Nelson Monument is managed by the City of Edinburgh Council Museums and Galleries and was closed to public access at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic.
- 2) Understands that there is currently no date for the reopening of the monument and that there are outstanding repairs and maintenance works required before it can reopen to the public and recommence generating revenue for the Council.

- 3) Agrees to a Business Bulletin update at the next Culture and Communities Committee outlining the scope and nature of the works, how they are proposed to be funded and when we may expect the reopening of the monument.”

- moved by Councillor McFarlane, seconded by Councillor Glasgow.

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor McFarlane:

18. By Councillor Osler – Fire Service

The following motion by Councillor Osler was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee notes with concern:

- 1) That the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service (**SFRS**) plan to remove the height rescue appliance (turntable ladder) from Crewe Toll Fire Station.
- 2) That this service change will leave the North West area of Edinburgh with no height rescue appliance even though this is needed to perform safe firefighting and rescues from buildings above 4 floors in height.
- 3) That this will leave only two height rescue appliances in West Lothian and the Scottish Borders.

Committee agrees:

- 4) That the Council Leader should meet urgently with the Head of Service Delivery for SFRS East Area, to establish for residents, businesses and other organisations, and SFRS staff alike, the full implications of this service change and what funding or other resource is needed to maintain current service and safety levels.
- 5) That the Council Leader will feed back to all Group Leaders and members of the committee following the meeting.

Committee further agrees that the Council Leader should write to the Scottish Government to express the Council's deep concerns at this change and to urge the Scottish Government to make sufficient resources available to ensure SFRS service and safety levels are maintained.”

Motion

To approve the motion.

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Thornley

Amendment

Replaces points 1 2 and 3 of the motion by Councillor Osler with:

Committee celebrates the year-round work of the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service in keeping our communities safe and thanks them for their service. However Committee notes with concern:

- 1) That the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service (SFRS) plan to remove the height rescue appliance (turntable ladder) from Crewe Toll Fire Station.
- 2) That this service change will leave the North West area of Edinburgh with no height rescue appliance even though this is needed to perform safe firefighting and rescues from buildings above 4 floors in height. Further acknowledges that Crewe Toll and surrounding areas including proposed development at Granton Waterfront feature many buildings of over four stories.
- 3) That this will leave only two height rescue appliances in place to service the vast geographical areas of Edinburgh, West Lothian and the Scottish Borders.
- 4) Notes that removing the appliance from Crewe Toll is not backed by the Fire Brigade Union due to concerns for public safety.

- moved by Councillor Nicolson, seconded by Councillor McFarlane

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), the amendment was adjusted and accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Osler:

- 1) To celebrate the year-round work of the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service in keeping communities safe and thank them for their service.
- 2) To note with concern that the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service (**SFRS**) planned to remove the height rescue appliance (turntable ladder) from Crewe Toll Fire Station.
- 3) To note with concern that this service change would leave the North West area of Edinburgh with no height rescue appliance even though this was needed to perform safe firefighting and rescues from buildings above 4 floors in height. To further acknowledge that Crewe Toll and surrounding areas including proposed development at Granton Waterfront featured many buildings of over four stories.
- 4) To note with concern that this would leave only two height rescue appliances in West Lothian and the Scottish Borders.
- 5) To note that removing the appliance from Crewe Toll was not backed by the Fire Brigade Union due to concerns for public safety.

- 6) To agree that the Council Leader should meet urgently with the Head of Service Delivery for SFRS East Area, to establish for residents, businesses and other organisations, and SFRS staff alike, the full implications of this service change and what funding or other resource was needed to maintain current service and safety levels.
- 7) To agree that the Council Leader would feed back to all Group Leaders and members of the committee following the meeting.
- 8) To further agree that the Council Leader should write to the Scottish Government to express the Council's deep concerns at this change and to urge the Scottish Government to make sufficient resources available to ensure SFRS service and safety levels were maintained.

19. By Councillor Thornley - Green Flag Awards

The following motion by Councillor Thornley was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee welcomes:

- 1) The recent announcement by environmental charity Keep Scotland Beautiful that 38 of Edinburgh’s Parks and Greenspaces have been presented with a Green Flag Award.

Committee notes:

- 2) That the Green Flag Award is bestowed upon spaces which demonstrate excellent adherence to environmental and management standards.
- 3) That Edinburgh is the local authority with the highest number of Green Flag awarded spaces in Scotland.
- 4) That this represents over a third of the parks and greenspaces in Scotland to receive the award
- 5) That 35 of the awarded parks are maintained by the Council, one by the Friends of Corstorphine Hill, one by NHS Lothian and one by Heriot Watt University.
- 6) That ‘Friends of’ groups across the city also put in an enormous amount of effort to keep our parks safe, well maintained, and accessible.

Committee thanks:

- 7) Council officers for their work and commitment over the past year, enabling so many of Edinburgh’s parks to achieve the award.
- 8) ‘Friends of’ groups across the city, whose commitment shows how highly valued our parks and greenspaces are by local communities.”

- moved by Councillor Thornley, seconded by Councillor Osler.

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Thornley

20. By Councillor Thornley - Community Centre Strategy Reporting

The following motion by Councillor McFarlane was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee notes:

- 1) The high level of public interest in the Community Centre Strategy, and anecdotal evidence from elected members regarding an increased volume of correspondence regarding the Strategy and its implications.
- 2) That Committee is not due to receive a report on progress with the strategy until mid 2024.
- 3) The decision by committee on 7th March 2023 to establish the Community Centre Strategy APOG.
- 4) That the APOG has now met twice, and has agreed to meet every six weeks going forward.
- 5) That APOGs are not decision-making bodies, open to the public or recorded for webcast.
- 6) Thanks officers for setting up a briefing session for councillors to be held later this month.

Committee therefore agrees:

- 7) That an interim report should be brought to committee for approval at its October meeting, providing an update on the approach being taken and progress to date.”

- moved by Councillor Thornley, seconded by Councillor Osler.

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Thornley.

21. By Councillor Nicolson - Crewe Toll Fire Station (Turntable Ladder)

Decision

To note that Councillor Nicolson had withdrawn her motion.

22. By Councillor Parker - Grass Cutting Standards

The following motion by Councillor Parker was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee:

- 1) Notes that the Council declared a Nature Emergency in February 2023, recognising the current state of nature, its inherent value and the crucial role its recovery and restoration will play in realising climate targets.
- 2) Notes that Plantlife’s annual “No Mow May” campaign which calls for green space managers not to mow grass during May is intended to maximize the space available for nature, and that this aim is in line with the Council’s declaration of a Nature Emergency.
- 3) Recognises that the operational impact of implementing a “No Mow May” policy is significant and that there might be better ways of achieving the intended outcomes of the “No Mow May” campaign – for example, by expanding the Living Landscape areas currently designated in the city, and by looking at grass cutting standards more generally.

Therefore:

- 4) Requests a report to Culture & Communities committee in 3 cycles to:
 - a) explore how the Council could expand the number of Living Landscape areas across the city (including across variable environments, not just in naturalised grassland areas);
 - b) explore how the Council could review grass cutting standards across its estate, looking at recategorizing areas to be kept to different maintenance standards – for example, designating recreation areas which have a more intense grass cutting schedule vs “wilder” areas such as greenways / road verges which have a more relaxed cutting regime.
- 5) Agrees that this report will also include consideration of necessary workforce changes and budgetary implications to deliver this, a timeline for implementation and details about how this work could tie in with other Council work / strategies such as the Nature Network, Biodiversity Action Plan, Thriving Greenspace Strategy, 2030 Climate Strategy and Edinburgh Adapts plan.”

Motion

To approve the motion by Councillor Parker.

- moved by Councillor Staniforth, seconded by Councillor Thornley

Amendment

To add before point a) in section 4) of the motion by Councillor Parker:

- “a) update Committee on the progress of the Living Landscapes initiative against the strategic objectives, measures of success and work programme outlined in the report to Transport and Environment Committee in June 2014 which decided to adopt the initiative.”

- moved by Councillor Osler, seconded by Councillor Heap

In accordance with Standing Order 22(12), the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Parker:

- 1) To note that the Council declared a Nature Emergency in February 2023, recognising the current state of nature, its inherent value and the crucial role its recovery and restoration would play in realising climate targets.
- 2) To note that Plantlife’s annual “No Mow May” campaign which called for green space managers not to mow grass during May was intended to maximize the space available for nature, and that this aim was in line with the Council’s declaration of a Nature Emergency.
- 3) To recognise that the operational impact of implementing a “No Mow May” policy was significant and that there might be better ways of achieving the intended outcomes of the “No Mow May” campaign – for example, by expanding the Living Landscape areas currently designated in the city, and by looking at grass cutting standards more generally.
- 4) To request a report to Culture and Communities Committee in 3 cycles to:
 - a) update Committee on the progress of the Living Landscapes initiative against the strategic objectives, measures of success and work programme outlined in the report to Transport and Environment Committee in June 2014 which decided to adopt the initiative.
 - b) explore how the Council could expand the number of Living Landscape areas across the city (including across variable environments, not just in naturalised grassland areas);
 - c) explore how the Council could review grass cutting standards across its estate, looking at recategorizing areas to be kept to different maintenance standards – for example, designating recreation areas which had a more intense grass cutting schedule vs “wilder” areas such as greenways / road verges which had a more relaxed cutting regime.
- 5) To agree that this report would also include consideration of necessary workforce changes and budgetary implications to deliver this, a timeline for

implementation and details about how this work could tie in with other Council work / strategies such as the Nature Network, Biodiversity Action Plan, Thriving Greenspace Strategy, 2030 Climate Strategy and Edinburgh Adapts plan.

23. By Councillor Caldwell - Montgomery Street Park Helter Skelter

The following motion by Councillor Caldwell was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee notes:

- 1) The Helter Skelter in the Montgomery Street playpark is the last standing Council-owned public Helter Skelter in Edinburgh and has been fenced off for a number of months.
- 2) The Helter Skelter is a meaningful piece of equipment, not just to residents in Hillside, but children across the city who have visited the park and ridden down it as a rite-of-passage.
- 3) The Helter Skelter was closed and previously marked for demolition before the Friends group liaised with Parks. The Helter Skelter cannot be replaced as they are not made any more and new models are generally not insured, but repairs may allow the current insurance to continue.
- 4) That the Friends of Montgomery Street Park have worked alongside the North East Parks team, liaised with local councillors, and explored options for an onsite safety assessment, which was due to start in July, as of writing.

Committee therefore requests;

- 5) The Culture and Communities Convener liaise with Officers and the Friends of Montgomery Street Park to explore and identify funding options for the assessment, which will need to be paid for whether the Helter Skelter is able to be rescued or not after said assessment.
- 6) The Convener reports back regarding funding to the Culture and Communities Business Bulletin in one cycle.”

- moved by Councillor Caldwell, seconded by Councillor Thornley.

The Committee had considered a written a deputation from Friends of the Montgomery Street Park and Chair of the Play Park Subgroup on this issue (see item 1(c) above).

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Caldwell.